

StreetsLA STAP RFP

Technical Proposal 80+ points = 50%; 60-79 points = 40%; 40-59 points = 30%; < 40 points = 20%

Respondent	Score (Points)	Variance	Tech Score (%)	Ranking
Tranzito	84.60	3.5	50%	1st
Intersection	81.10	9.7	50%	2nd
Outfront Decaux	71.40	12.3	40%	3rd
InSite	59.10		30%	4th

Price Proposal: 1st = 50%; 2nd = 45%; 3rd = 35%

Respondent			Price Score (%)	Ranking
Tranzito			50%	1st
Outfront Decaux			45%	2nd
Intersection			0%	n/a

Combined Scores

Respondent	Tech Score %	Price Score %	Total %	Ranking
Tranzito	50%	50%	100%	1st
Outfront Decaux	40%	45%	85%	2nd
Intersection	50%	0%	50%	3rd
InSite	30%	0%	30%	4th

StreetsLA STAP RFP

Technical Proposal 80+ points = 50%; 60-79 points = 40%; 40-59 points = 30%; < 40 points = 20%

Respondent	Evaluator 6	Evaluator 10	Evaluator 5	Evaluator 3	Evaluator 7	Evaluator 8	Evaluator 4	Evaluator 9	Evaluator 2	Evaluator 1	Total	Average
Outfront Decaux	39	81	76	53	71	83	75	79	79	78	714	71.40
Intersection	72	87	78	79	72	90	84	82	82	85	811	81.10
InSite	33	76	63	25	61	87	68	76	68	34	591	59.10
Tranzito	77	91	83	83	78	91	89	86	85	83	846	84.60

Technical Proposal Findings

Technical Proposals were evaluated prior to Price Proposals. Scores for Technical Proposals were awarded on a 100 point scale. The distribution of those points is listed below. Nine of the 10 Evaluation Committee members awarded the highest score to Tranzito and the second highest score to Intersection. Outfront Decaux was awarded the third highest score and InSite the lowest score by nine of the 10 members.

The major finding was that InSite's low score, which had a variance of 12 points from the score above it, was indicative of weaknesses in its technical proposal. Specifically, the Evaluation Committee found that InSite would deliver a basic shelter program that did not demonstrate an understanding of the City's vision for STAP relative to design, technology, sustainability, and innovation. InSite's technical proposal would not acheive STAP's goals in key areas, therefore, its Price Proposal was not considered.

100 points distributed as follows:	
Qualifications	25
Approach & Methodology	25
Program Build Out & Refresh Plans	15
Design	15
Sustainability	10
Innovative Approaches	10

StreetsLA STAP RFP

Price Proposal: 1st = 50%; 2nd = 45%; 3rd = 35%

Respondent	Evaluator A	Evaluator B	Evaluator C	Total	Average
Outfront Decaux	2	1	2	5	1.67
Intersection	0	0	0	0	0.00
Tranzito	1	2	1	4	1.33

2nd

1st

Price Proposal Findings

Following the assessment of Technical Proposals, the top three respondents' Price Proposals were reviewed by a subgroup of the Evaluation Committee, which included representation from the City's CAO and CLA offices. The subcommittee reviewed analyses of the different scenarios offered, looking specifically at the balance of two factors: a) Capital Participation- whether the respondent uses its own capital, the City's capital or a combination for the purchase and installation of STAP elements, and b) Revenue Share- the percentage of estimated gross program revenues that will be given to the City. The estimate of gross revenues is a reflection of the respondent's proposed mix of types and numbers of STAP elements and their ability to sell the advertising space on those elements. Price Proposals were ranked based on which was deemed the most advantageous to the City.

Tranzito's price proposal included scenarios for outside capital funding via a Special Purpose Vehicle (SPV), which was deemed by the subcommittee as less beneficial due to four key risk factors: 1) Policy & Program Control, 2) Accountability concerning public engagement & sensitivity to issues such as digital, 3) reduced Revenue Share, and 4) the potential for a longer decision making process for funding STAP. While the SPV option was not a preferred scenario for the City, Tranzito did provide a proposal that demonstrated multiple revenue opportunities in addition to advertising with a significant share of those revenues to the City as well as a Minimum Annual Guarantee (MAG). While Tranzito's proposal had the highest level of capital expenditure, those expenses addressed the majority of STAP goals and had the best potential to achieve those goals.

Outfront/Decaux's price proposal offered preferred scenarios for capital participation by a private partner; however, the City's share of revenue in either of those scenarios was either zero or an inadequate percentage. The proposed scenario for 100% City capital participation also offered an inadequate share of revenue to the City. Outfront/Decaux did offer a tiered share structure where the City would have receive a higher percentage upon achievement of higher levels of revenue, but the associated thresholds are not reasonably attainable based on the respondent's revenue projections and reference checks. An additional concern was that the estimated capital was understated as Outfront/Decaux proposed limited quantities of program elements that could address STAP goals.

Intersection proposed only the scenario where the City would provide 100% of the capital and requested the City also participate at some level (up to 50%) in operating expenses related to "Digital Hardware Maintenance." Intersection did state that it could provide scenarios as requested in the RFP with outside capital funding, but those would be proposed using a Special Purpose Vehicle. Intersection's sole proposal would require a longer term than 10 years to be financially feasible. Additionally, without providing at least the two other scenarios for 50% and 100% partner capital participation, Intersection's price proposal could not be properly compared with the other responses. Therefore, Intersection was eliminated during this assessment and did not receive an associated rank.

RESPONDENT: INSITE STREET MEDIA**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS****WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	11
Remarks: Proposer met all of the stated criteria but was weak on experience implementing new forms of technology. This was a weakness throughout the proposal.	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	10
Remarks: Proposer met most of the stated criteria but did not include examples or discussion on how equity would be achieved. Their phased rollout plan also pushes back Mobility Hub Elements out to Year 5 and does not provide information on what they would look like.	

RESPONDENT: INSITE STREET MEDIA

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	3

Remarks: Proposer marginally met the stated criteria by not including information regarding 3.1b and 3.2a.

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	
Design Score:	6

Remarks: Proposer met most of the stated criteria but only provided three (3) conceptual shelter designs and stated that additional shelter designs would be based on components of those 3 designs. Proposer had interesting ideas for lighting and a local artist program but did not state experience or case studies where they have implemented these ideas.

RESPONDENT: INSITE STREET MEDIA

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	<p>Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	2
Remarks: Proposer marginally met the stated criteria by simply committing to the RFP criteria without providing examples or information on how they would or have achieved this criteria in the past.	
6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	<p>Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	2
Remarks: Proposer marginally met the stated criteria by providing some creative and innovative ideas but did not demonstrate experience or provide examples of where they have implemented them.	
INSITE STREET MEDIA TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS	
	34

Date: 5/3/21

RESPONDENT: INSITE STREET MEDIA**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS****WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	18
Remarks: experience providing bus bench contract for the City of Los Angeles	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	18
Remarks: Generally meets or commits to meeting criteria as requested in RFP. Not much detail provided in terms of digital displays and smart/technology components other than committing to do so. Strengths seem to be in advertising experience and with operating and maintenance procedures but unclear if and how this will translate with shift to more digital displays as described in RFP	

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	11

Remarks: General commitment to meet transition and refresh/relocation plans as described in RFP. Proposal included skepticism of Vision Zero and Mobilty Hub efforts as way to frame STAP.

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	
Design Score:	10

Remarks: Provides three basic design concepts with various iterations of each concept; focus more on shade and shelter than the technology components. Incorporates lighting into design concept.

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	5

Remarks: Overall commitment to sustainability as requested by BSS

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	6

Remarks: "hyperlocal" sales program to reach neighborhood-level businesses; multicultural sales plan

INSITE STREET MEDIA TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS	68
---	-----------

Reviewer Name: _____

Reviewer Signature: _____

Date: ___/___/21

RESPONDENT: INSITE STREET MEDIA**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS****WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	6
Remarks: Does not have ample experience in new forms of technology or in managing a program of this size.	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	6

Remarks: Lacks a creative vision for STAP, goals are not as ambitious as the City expects.	
3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	4
Remarks: Too technical, lacks the vision about the overall program.	
4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	

Design Score:		5
Remarks: Designs feel randomly generated and include an unnecessary and visually confusing combination of textures, materials, and graphics that lack an organizing motif.		
5. Sustainability		(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources) 5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing 5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods 5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture 5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use 5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities 5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture 5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies. 5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available. 5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically 5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities		Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Sustainability Points:		3
Remarks:		
6. Innovative Approaches		(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are Public art features reflective of community Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts		Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.
Innovative Approaches Points:		1
Remarks:		
INSITE STREET MEDIA TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS		25

RESPONDENT: INSITE STREET MEDIA**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS****WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	20
Remarks: Local company, familiar with the City. Current contractor for the City's transit bench program. Extensive experience managing bus benches. Project manager with 17 years experience in Street Furniture/Outdoor Advertising.	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	20

Remarks: Hyperlocal sales program with some focus on national advertisers. Plan to utilize "hybrid" automated selling and buying and expand into programmatic advertising. Also discussed some experimental advertising; sampling, street teams, pop ups and tour stops. Partner with Broadsign CMS, and Apparitix Media Solutions for inventory management. Sensitive to public perception of increased digital advertising; propose to use a phased approach and bring on a research and strategy firm to help with messaging.

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	<p>Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	13

Remarks: 770 new digital shelters in year 1, and 664 existing shelters to be relocated. 750 new static shelters per year in years 2-4, with mini-mobility hub elements (eLockers, docking stations) in year 5. Storage facilities allow for shelter refurbishment to be ongoing starting in year 1. Insite to coordinate permitting. California Building Code is not mentioned under Required Compliance. Insite is familiar with City sidewalks, existing shelters and challenges. \$4500 allocated per site for sidewalk/site rehabilitation. Deployment schedule assumes sites are ready to receive new/refurbished shelters.

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	<p>Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	
Design Score:	7

Remarks: Design concept #2 includes interesting lighting effects to signal bus arrival and emergencies. Overall, design concepts meet basic requirements but lack creativity.

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	5

Remarks: Solar panels allow for lighting at all shelters.

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	3

Remarks: Propose to include local art on refurbished shelters. Design concepts included local art as a part of the façade design. Experimental advertising; sampling, street teams, pop ups and tour stops. Although Insite demonstrated a willingness to comply with the City's requests, the proposal lacked innovation and creativity.

INSITE STREET MEDIA TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS	68
---	-----------

RESPONDENT: INSITE STREET MEDIA**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS****WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	18
Remarks: InSite has strong knowledge of Los Angeles from their years of experience with the bus bench contract and executive office location within the city. Glenn Flutie seems to have strong operational knowledge for large infrastructure programs. But the team seemed less strong in its implementation of new technology; its focus seemed to be on the "nuts and bolts" of keeping the furniture maintained and clean.	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	17

Remarks: Business plan seemed realistic overall, with rollout of requested digital shelters in year 1 and new static shelters in years 2-4. Appear to have an experienced sales team. Much of the CMS and deployment language in proposal seemed drawn from the RFP language directly, with less elaboration than proposals from other teams. Demonstrated less sophistication in digital content discussion than other teams. Also did not have any significant discussion of the specifics of their equity approach: this was, in part, due to their failure to submit an actual deployment plan with a map, as some other teams did. The lead firm's financials were only updated to December 2018, not providing any information on the effects on the pandemic. However, discussion of hyperlocal sales, small business focus, and multicultural potential was stronger. They also had an impressive program providing jobs to veterans and formerly incarcerated individuals.

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	11

Remarks: Overall presented a thoughtful approach to build-out – they did get to 770 in year 1 – and had an appropriate emphasis on phasing.

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	

Design Score:	6
---------------	---

Remarks: This was the weakest design submission of the four firms under consideration. The proposal did not fully articulate what the proposers were trying to achieve with each of the three design concepts (La Brea, Cahuenga, and Olvera). All of these shared a similar, but very basic, design vocabulary. The design team (Icon Architectural Group) is more of an engineering and construction design firm from the Midwest; their experience is stronger in technology and engineering than on urban design.

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	7

Remarks: Proposal incorporated basic sustainability features but this was not a strong emphasis in their overall written proposal or oral presentation.

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	4

Remarks: This was least innovative of the four proposals: overall the approach felt very basic and traditional.

INSITE STREET MEDIA TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS	63
--	----

RESPONDENT: INSITE STREET MEDIA**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS****WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	8
Remarks:	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	9

Remarks:	
3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	5

Remarks:

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	

Design Score:	5
---------------	---

Remarks:

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	<p>Points are awarded on the following basis:</p> <p>Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information.</p> <p>Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria.</p> <p>Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria.</p> <p>Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.</p> <p>Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	4

Remarks:

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are	<p>Points are awarded on the following basis:</p> <p>Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information.</p> <p>Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria.</p> <p>Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria.</p> <p>Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.</p>
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	2

Remarks:

INSITE STREET MEDIA TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS	33
--	----

RESPONDENT: INSITE STREET MEDIA**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS****WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	20
Remarks:	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	15

Remarks:	
3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	10
Remarks:	

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	
Design Score:	7

Remarks:

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	7

Remarks:

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	2

Remarks:

INSITE STREET MEDIA TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS	61
---	-----------

RESPONDENT: INSITE STREET MEDIA**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS****WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	23
Did not seem to have has impressive a track record as some of the other respondents	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	23

Seemed to focus more on static vs digital display, had a good plan to reach out to very local small scale bussiness for advertising

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	<p>Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	12

Seemed to recognize the challenges posed by the lage scale deployment but has a plan to make it achievable

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	<p>Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	
Design Score:	12

Appealing designs with an opportunity to incorporate local art in the fascia

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	8
Sustainability was touched on but not elaborately so although I believe they have an understanding of how to address the issue	
6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	9
Not as innovative as some of the other respondents but some workable ideas	
INSITE STREET MEDIA TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS	87

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS		WEIGHT RATIONALE	
1. Qualifications of the Firm		(0-25 points)	
1.1 Company profile		Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.	
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments			
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology			
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients			
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs			
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services			
1.7 References			
Qualifications of the Firm Score:		21	
Remarks:			
2. Approach & Methodology		(0-25 points)	
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity		Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.	
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise			
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W			
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components			
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy			
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System			
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales			
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)			
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising			
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing			
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates			
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials			
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security			
Approach & Methodology Score:		18	
Remarks:			
3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans		(0-15 points)	
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers		Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.	
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals			
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need			
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods			
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:		12	
Remarks:			
4. Design		(0-15 points)	
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort		Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.	
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W			
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP			
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity			
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W			
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)			
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City			
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments			
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components			
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter			
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services			
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards			
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image			
Design Score:			11
Remarks:			
5. Sustainability			(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)		Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.	
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials			
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods			
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture			
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use			
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities			
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture			
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.			
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.			
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight			
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities			
Sustainability Points:			7
Remarks:			
6. Innovative Approaches			(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:		Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.	
Public art features reflective of community			
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment			
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation			
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts			
Innovative Approaches Points:			
Remarks:		7	
INSITE STREET MEDIA TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS		76	

RESPONDENT: INSITE STREET MEDIA

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS

WEIGHT RATIONALE

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	21
Remarks: Insite Street Media is the premier bus stop bench provider in Los Angeles County. However, it wasn't clear what large urban city they have established transit shelters. There presentation noted cities, but not specific inventory numbers. I feel it is uncertain that project team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services.	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	

2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	15
Remarks: Uncertain if Insite Street Media team understands and is committed to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity. It appears the team understands the importance of a CMS that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement. Their sales plan shows their sales goals to increase gross revenue.	
3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	12
Remarks: Team provided a plan and schedule for installation and replacement of shelters. Delivery timelines address STAP's yearly installation goals. The team demonstrated advertising elements that supported local communities.	
4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	

4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	
Design Score:	12

Remarks: Responder provided necessary conceptual shelter desings. Desings appear to meet transit rider and pedestrian needs. Designs of shelters shown were modular and available in various configerations. Shelter designs showed digital and static displays.

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	8

Remarks: The Insite team proposed reusing/relocating existing bus shelters to place newer technology shelters in high use areas. Proposed shelters will use digital technology and energy efficient lighting. Team proposed using non-toxic materials and/or color coated materials that are interchangeable.

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information.
Public art features reflective of community	Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria.
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria.
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	8

Remarks: The team proposed communicating with local artists regarding public art on shelters relative to the communities. Insite didn't present installing equipment that would increase access to City services, such as bill paying or transit fare payment.

INSITE STREET MEDIA TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS	76
--	----