

StreetsLA STAP RFP**Technical Proposal 80+ points = 50%; 60-79 points = 40%; 40-59 points = 30%; < 40 points = 20%**

Respondent	Score (Points)	Variance	Tech Score (%)	Ranking
Tranzito	84.60	3.5	50%	1st
Intersection	81.10	9.7	50%	2nd
Outfront Decaux	71.40	12.3	40%	3rd
InSite	59.10		30%	4th

Price Proposal: 1st = 50%; 2nd = 45%; 3rd = 35%

Respondent			Price Score (%)	Ranking
Tranzito			50%	1st
Outfront Decaux			45%	2nd
Intersection			0%	n/a

Combined Scores

Respondent	Tech Score %	Price Score %	Total %	Ranking
Tranzito	50%	50%	100%	1st
Outfront Decaux	40%	45%	85%	2nd
Intersection	50%	0%	50%	3rd
InSite	30%	0%	30%	4th

StreetsLA STAP RFP

Technical Proposal 80+ points = 50%; 60-79 points = 40%; 40-59 points = 30%; < 40 points = 20%

Respondent	Evaluator 6	Evaluator 10	Evaluator 5	Evaluator 3	Evaluator 7	Evaluator 8	Evaluator 4	Evaluator 9	Evaluator 2	Evaluator 1	Total	Average
Outfront Decaux	39	81	76	53	71	83	75	79	79	78	714	71.40
Intersection	72	87	78	79	72	90	84	82	82	85	811	81.10
InSite	33	76	63	25	61	87	68	76	68	34	591	59.10
Tranzito	77	91	83	83	78	91	89	86	85	83	846	84.60

Technical Proposal Findings

Technical Proposals were evaluated prior to Price Proposals. Scores for Technical Proposals were awarded on a 100 point scale. The distribution of those points is listed below. Nine of the 10 Evaluation Committee members awarded the highest score to Tranzito and the second highest score to Intersection. Outfront Decaux was awarded the third highest score and InSite the lowest score by nine of the 10 members.

The major finding was that InSite's low score, which had a variance of 12 points from the score above it, was indicative of weaknesses in its technical proposal. Specifically, the Evaluation Committee found that InSite would deliver a basic shelter program that did not demonstrate an understanding of the City's vision for STAP relative to design, technology, sustainability, and innovation. InSite's technical proposal would not achieve STAP's goals in key areas, therefore, its Price Proposal was not considered.

100 points distributed as follows:

Qualifications	25
Approach & Methodology	25
Program Build Out & Refresh Plans	15
Design	15
Sustainability	10
Innovative Approaches	10

StreetsLA STAP RFP

Price Proposal: 1st = 50%; 2nd = 45%; 3rd = 35%

Respondent	Evaluator A	Evaluator B	Evaluator C	Total	Average
Outfront Decaux	2	1	2	5	1.67
Intersection	0	0	0	0	0.00
Tranzito	1	2	1	4	1.33

2nd

1st

Price Proposal Findings

Following the assessment of Technical Proposals, the top three respondents' Price Proposals were reviewed by a subgroup of the Evaluation Committee, which included representation from the City's CAO and CLA offices. The subcommittee reviewed analyses of the different scenarios offered, looking specifically at the balance of two factors: a) Capital Participation- whether the respondent uses its own capital, the City's capital or a combination for the purchase and installation of STAP elements, and b) Revenue Share- the percentage of estimated gross program revenues that will be given to the City. The estimate of gross revenues is a reflection of the respondent's proposed mix of types and numbers of STAP elements and their ability to sell the advertising space on those elements. Price Proposals were ranked based on which was deemed the most advantageous to the City.

Tranzito's price proposal included scenarios for outside capital funding via a Special Purpose Vehicle (SPV), which was deemed by the subcommittee as less beneficial due to four key risk factors: 1) Policy & Program Control, 2) Accountability concerning public engagement & sensitivity to issues such as digital, 3) reduced Revenue Share, and 4) the potential for a longer decision making process for funding STAP. While the SPV option was not a preferred scenario for the City, Tranzito did provide a proposal that demonstrated multiple revenue opportunities in addition to advertising with a significant share of those revenues to the City as well as a Minimum Annual Guarantee (MAG). While Tranzito's proposal had the highest level of capital expenditure, those expenses addressed the majority of STAP goals and had the best potential to achieve those goals.

Outfront/Decaux's price proposal offered preferred scenarios for capital participation by a private partner; however, the City's share of revenue in either of those scenarios was either zero or an inadequate percentage. The proposed scenario for 100% City capital participation also offered an inadequate share of revenue to the City. Outfront/Decaux did offer a tiered share structure where the City would have receive a higher percentage upon achievement of higher levels of revenue, but the associated thresholds are not reasonably attainable based on the respondent's revenue projections and reference checks. An additional concern was that the estimated capital was understated as Outfront/Decaux proposed limited quantities of program elements that could address STAP goals.

Intersection proposed only the scenario where the City would provide 100% of the capital and requested the City also participate at some level (up to 50%) in operating expenses related to "Digital Hardware Maintenance." Intersection did state that it could provide scenarios as requested in the RFP with outside capital funding, but those would be proposed using a Special Purpose Vehicle. Intersection's sole proposal would require a longer term than 10 years to be financially feasible. Additionally, without providing at least the two other scenarios for 50% and 100% partner capital participation, Intersection's price proposal could not be properly compared with the other responses. Therefore, Intersection was eliminated during this assessment and did not receive an associated rank.

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS

WEIGHT RATIONALE

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	25
Remarks: Proposal exceeded all the criteria and sited case studies of actual experience in the implementation of new forms of technology and in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients.	
(0-25 points)	
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	10
Remarks: Proposal meets most of the stated criteria. The proposer does not have a Content Management System capable of performing the stated requirements.	

RESPONDENT: OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans		(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.	
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals		
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need		
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods		
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:		10

Remarks: Proposal met all the stated criteria for this area but it was presented mainly through diagrams without much of a narrative.

4. Design		(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.	
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W		
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP		
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity		
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W		
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)		
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City		
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments		
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components		
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter		
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services		
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards		
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image		
Design Score:		15

Remarks: Proposer exceeded the stated criteria by presenting numerous design options above the stated requirement of 6.

RESPONDENT: OFFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)	
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.	
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials		
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods		
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture		
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use		
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities		
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture		
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.		
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.		
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight		
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities		
Sustainability Points:		10

Remarks: Proposer exceeded the stated criteria by addressing each of them thoroughly.

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	8

Remarks: Proposer met all the stated criteria but was weak regarding the demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts.

OFFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS:	78
---	-----------

RESPONDENT: OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS

WEIGHT RATIONALE

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	21
Remarks: Firm has provided City's street furniture and managed advertising as part of incumbent contract; proposal focuses mostly on the street furniture experience and less on the technology aspect or new forms of technology.	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	20
Remarks: Written proposal better than Zoom presentation	

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	10

Remarks: based mostly on proposed seamless shift from current contract to new contract if awarded

4. Design	(0-15 points)	
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.	
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W		
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP		
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity		
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W		
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)		
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City		
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments		
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components		
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter		
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services		
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards		
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image		
Design Score:		13

Remarks: All six shelter designs had multiple options, additional elements, pattern and/or art-based variations. Proposed sunshade as additional program element to complement bus shelters and/or be used individually at identified locations.

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	

Remarks:

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	

Remarks: unique sunshade / blade bench program element

OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS:	79
--	-----------

Reviewer Name: _____

Reviewer Signature: _____

Date: ___/___/21

RESPONDENT: OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS

WEIGHT RATIONALE

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	21
Remarks: Overall exceptional qualifications. Some concerns about past/current performance.	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	6

Remarks:
Lack of understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for STAP, specifically use of local advertising and increasing revenue.

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	

Remarks:
Did not include a schedule for transitioning the program. Did not reference a refresh/relocation plan.

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	

Design Score:	13
Remarks: Strong STAP brand image. Good variety in the types of designs to meet transit riders' needs. Creative uses of color and material.	
5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b <u>Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing</u>	
5.1c <u>Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods</u>	
5.1d <u>Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture</u>	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b <u>Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically</u>	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	Sustainability Points: 5
Remarks:	
6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	4
Remarks:	
OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS 53	

RESPONDENT: OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS	WEIGHT RATIONALE
1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	22
<p>Remarks: Experienced company familiar with the City and its challenges. Current operator for Metro bus advertising.</p>	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	

Remarks: Acknowledges possible community push back to additional digital advertising, with responsibility on the City to resolve issues. Committed to expanding their business inclusion program. Thorough maintenance plan, including asset management system. Broadsign for Content Management System. Local and national sales teams with increased programmatic sales in the future. Outreach to small and minority businesses.

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	10

Remarks: Includes installation of concrete pad, sidewalk rehabilitation to ADA compliance is not included. No mention of mobility hubs. 10-year contract begins after all 770 are installed. 664 shelters installed in year 1.

4. Design	(0-15 points)	
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.	
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W		
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP		
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity		
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W		
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)		
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City		
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments		
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components		
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter		
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services		
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards		
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image		
Design Score:		13

Remarks: Flexible "kit of parts." Conducted shade analysis to aid in design. Innovative vertical rotating panel to maximize shade, and lean bars at tree wells. Creative and functional design options from multiple design consultants.

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	5

Remarks: Propose use of LEED certified materials and solar panels.

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	5

Remarks: Propose integrating local art into shelters. Unclear how the program is intended to evolve over time.

OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS:	75
--	-----------

RESPONDENT: OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC	
TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS	WEIGHT RATIONALE
1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	<p>Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	
Remarks:	
<p>Outfront Decaux has had a contract with City of Los Angeles for the last 20 years, over 25 years of experience in the outdoor furniture business. The proposal is a joint venture with Outfront media. Operates coordinated street furniture contract for NYC (shelters, digital newsstand, art on the grid) as well as other municipalities in LA County. Francois Nion would be the Project Manager for Outfront Decaux. Shelterclean will operate the maintenance and cleaning of shelters. Design will be done by Selber Perkins, Perkins + Will, and Studio MLA. However, based on current contract performance, we would have concerns about extending a contractual agreement with Outfront Decaux.</p>	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	<p>Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	

Remarks: They appear to have a good understanding of ridership demographics, social equity, and the City's desire to make bus ridership a more comfortable experience in order to get people out of their cars and into public transit by improving comfort and augmenting amenities. They emphasized their understanding of the importance of shade and comfort during their presentation. They do have experience working with Los Angeles' Council Offices, Neighborhood Councils, and coordinating with Metro. The 10-year term will begin when all 770 digital structures are installed and connected to power; The proposal is to provide 3,000 bus shelters, 106 urban panels, 3,000 trash/recycling bins, five interactive kiosks, five vending kiosks, five eLockers and 50 Sunshade for Outdoor Spaces or the capital expenditure of \$113 million, whichever comes first. This program will produce revenues beginning in Year 1, goes up to \$53M by Year 5. Two revenue share scenarios are proposed.	
3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	8
Remarks: The 10-year term will begin when all 770 digital structures are installed and connected to power; per the Price Prosoal 664 existing structures will be rehabilitated. The proposal is to provide 3,000 bus shelters, 106 urban panels, 3,000 trash/recycling bins, five interactive kiosks, five vending kiosks, five eLockers and 50 Sunshade for Outdoor Spaces or the capital expenditure of \$113 million, whichever comes first. It should be noted that repair and upgrade of existing sidewalks and time and cost for community outreach is not included - these issues are brushed over and could add to costs. They have included a sample map of Council District 10 showing upgraded locations and new street furniture locations.	
4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	

	Design Score: 12
Remarks: They are partnering with Selbert Perkins, Perkins + Will and StudioMLA on design. The concept is a modular kit of parts with amenities such as wayfinding, handwashing, touch-screen LED displays and movable seating. The rotating blade benches, customizable perforated panels, and ability to place local artwork are all innovative approaches. However, the proposal is less successful in delivering an overall design aesthetic that reflects Los Angeles' vernacular. The wave and the lantern designs are most interesting - but it's unclear how they relate to the The Avenue, Las Palmas, and Angels Wing concepts by Selbert Perkins. How do these concepts relate to one another and how do they create a unified design theme across the City?	
5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing	Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria.
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria.
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	8
Remarks: This team performed more shade studies than any other team. The quality and comfort of stations is paramount. Solar panels are proposed on the roofs of 1,500 shelters. Additionally, 4,000 sunshades are proposed in addition to the bus shelters. This team also proposes to include data collection and smart city solutions such as real time traffic information working with the City's ITA as well as air quality sensors which is an objective of the Mayor's Green New Deal. I did not see a reuse/repurposing plan in the proposal aside from the reuse of concrete pads and electrical conduit where feasible.	
6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are	Points are awarded on the following basis:
Public art features reflective of community	Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information.
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria.
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria.
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.
Innovative Approaches Points:	8
Remarks: They have proposed green roofs, innovative double sided benches, parklets, UAM (drones) in their conceptual designs. Public art features are included on back and side perforated panels.	
OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS: 76	

RESPONDENT: OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS

WEIGHT RATIONALE

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	
Remarks:	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	8

Remarks:	
3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	3

Remarks:

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	

Design Score:	12
----------------------	-----------

Remarks:

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b <u>Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing</u>	
5.1c <u>Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods</u>	
5.1d <u>Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture</u>	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b <u>Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically</u>	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	4

Remarks:

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	2

Remarks:

OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS:	39
--	-----------

RESPONDENT: OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS	WEIGHT RATIONALE
1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	20
Remarks: Very established firm. Very traditional in technology and new business model areas.	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	20

Remarks: More info on the CMS, connectivity, access and control the City would have to load and control content would have been nice.

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	10

Remarks: Meets stated criteria

4. Design	(0-15 points)	
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.	
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W		
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP		
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity		
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W		
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)		
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City		
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments		
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components		
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter		
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services		
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards		
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image		
Design Score:		10

Remarks: Designs lean toward traditional and are very functional.

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	

Sustainability Points: **7**

Remarks: DeCaux certainly has experience of operations of a street furniture program in the City, but with the evolving and needs of the City, additional depth of the DeCaux approach would have been desired.

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	

Innovative Approaches Points: **4**

Remarks: Not much detail on CMS or how the kiosks will increase access to city services - connectivity of devices.

OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS:	71
--	-----------

RESPONDENT: OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS

WEIGHT RATIONALE

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	25
<p>Being the current manager of the City's STAP OutFront Decaux has a very detailed knowledge of the system so their experience is very good</p>	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	

The plan did not seem very innovative, more a continuation of what they are doing now with some digital panels added.

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	11

Demonstrated a pretty good understanding of the logistical issues

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	
Design Score:	

Some of the designs seemed a little generic, good ideas to deal with stops with issues like insufficient room for ADA access

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	Sustainability Points: 8

Recognized the City's commitment to sustainability, but a little thin on details

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	7

Not as innovative as some of the other respondents

OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS:	83
--	----

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS

WEIGHT RATIONALE

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	23

Remarks:

2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	

Remarks:

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:	12

Remarks:

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	
Design Score:	

Remarks:

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	7

Remarks:

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
Innovative Approaches Points:	8

Remarks:

RESPONDENT: OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS

WEIGHT RATIONALE

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
Qualifications of the Firm Score:	22
Remarks: Outfront Decaux has the required years of experience. The project manager many years of experiencing managing a large shelter program. The team clearly displays knowledge and experience fulfilling the required services.	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	

2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
Approach & Methodology Score:	20
<p>Remarks: Outfront Decaux clearly has a business plan for day to day operations and program management. They are a large out of home business company. Deployment of digital displays and smart technology are the company's goal to improve. Outfront Decaux uses a sub contractor for cleaning and maintaining bus stop furniture. They intend to manage the delivery of all advertising and City messaging through utilization of the broadsign CMS. The team will manage through an established Network Operations Center.</p>	
3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	<p>Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	

Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:

13

Remarks: Outfront Decaux presented a detailed program on how they manage to provide the best delivery of shade for bus patrons. The team presented a variety of shelter designs for an improved experience for pedestrians and bus patrons. The presentation of "blade" shade structures is a novel idea. They have a plan to re-locate existing shelter and provide new shelters with improved advertising elements that are beneficial for communities.

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	<p>Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	

Design Score:

12

Remarks: Shelter designs are geared to reflect the cultural diversity of LA. Shelter components integrate sustainable materials with a variety of textures and colors to complement adjacent buildings/structures.

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
Sustainability Points:	

Remarks: Outfront Decaux propose a significant number of shelters will be reused. However, they propose a high number of non-ad shelters. Outfront Decaux appears to be the only team that includes shade structures in their inventory.

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis:
Public art features reflective of community	Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information.
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria.
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria.
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.
Innovative Approaches Points:	6

Remarks: Outfront Decaux is presenting to install over 2,000 non-ad shelters with only 100 static and over 600 digital signs. They propose installing 5 vending kiosks

OUTFRONT DECAUX STREET FURNITURE, LLC TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS:	81
--	-----------