

**StreetsLA STAP RFP****Technical Proposal 80+ points = 50%; 60-79 points = 40%; 40-59 points = 30%; < 40 points = 20%**

<b>Respondent</b>	<b>Score (Points)</b>	<b>Variance</b>	<b>Tech Score (%)</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Tranzito	84.60	3.5	50%	1st
Intersection	81.10	9.7	50%	2nd
Outfront Decaux	71.40	12.3	40%	3rd
InSite	59.10		30%	4th

**Price Proposal: 1st = 50%; 2nd = 45%; 3rd = 35%**

<b>Respondent</b>			<b>Price Score (%)</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Tranzito			50%	1st
Outfront Decaux			45%	2nd
Intersection			0%	n/a

**Combined Scores**

<b>Respondent</b>	<b>Tech Score %</b>	<b>Price Score %</b>	<b>Total %</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Tranzito	50%	50%	100%	1st
Outfront Decaux	40%	45%	85%	2nd
Intersection	50%	0%	50%	3rd
InSite	30%	0%	30%	4th

**StreetsLA STAP RFP**

**Technical Proposal 80+ points = 50%; 60-79 points = 40%; 40-59 points = 30%; < 40 points = 20%**

Respondent	Evaluator 6	Evaluator 10	Evaluator 5	Evaluator 3	Evaluator 7	Evaluator 8	Evaluator 4	Evaluator 9	Evaluator 2	Evaluator 1	Total	Average
Outfront Decaux	39	81	76	53	71	83	75	79	79	78	714	<b>71.40</b>
Intersection	72	87	78	79	72	90	84	82	82	85	811	<b>81.10</b>
InSite	33	76	63	25	61	87	68	76	68	34	591	<b>59.10</b>
Tranzito	77	91	83	83	78	91	89	86	85	83	846	<b>84.60</b>

**Technical Proposal Findings**

Technical Proposals were evaluated prior to Price Proposals. Scores for Technical Proposals were awarded on a 100 point scale. The distribution of those points is listed below. Nine of the 10 Evaluation Committee members awarded the highest score to Tranzito and the second highest score to Intersection. Outfront Decaux was awarded the third highest score and InSite the lowest score by nine of the 10 members.

The major finding was that InSite's low score, which had a variance of 12 points from the score above it, was indicative of weaknesses in its technical proposal. Specifically, the Evaluation Committee found that InSite would deliver a basic shelter program that did not demonstrate an understanding of the City's vision for STAP relative to design, technology, sustainability, and innovation. InSite's technical proposal would not achieve STAP's goals in key areas, therefore, its Price Proposal was not considered.

100 points distributed as follows:

Qualifications	25
Approach & Methodology	25
Program Build Out & Refresh Plans	15
Design	15
Sustainability	10
Innovative Approaches	10

**StreetsLA STAP RFP**

**Price Proposal: 1st = 50%; 2nd = 45%; 3rd = 35%**

<b>Respondent</b>	<b>Evaluator A</b>	<b>Evaluator B</b>	<b>Evaluator C</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>Average</b>
Outfront Decaux	2	1	2	5	1.67
Intersection	0	0	0	0	0.00
Tranzito	1	2	1	4	1.33

2nd

1st

**Price Proposal Findings**

Following the assessment of Technical Proposals, the top three respondents' Price Proposals were reviewed by a subgroup of the Evaluation Committee, which included representation from the City's CAO and CLA offices. The subcommittee reviewed analyses of the different scenarios offered, looking specifically at the balance of two factors: a) Capital Participation- whether the respondent uses its own capital, the City's capital or a combination for the purchase and installation of STAP elements, and b) Revenue Share- the percentage of estimated gross program revenues that will be given to the City. The estimate of gross revenues is a reflection of the respondent's proposed mix of types and numbers of STAP elements and their ability to sell the advertising space on those elements. Price Proposals were ranked based on which was deemed the most advantageous to the City.

Tranzito's price proposal included scenarios for outside capital funding via a Special Purpose Vehicle (SPV), which was deemed by the subcommittee as less beneficial due to four key risk factors: 1) Policy & Program Control, 2) Accountability concerning public engagement & sensitivity to issues such as digital, 3) reduced Revenue Share, and 4) the potential for a longer decision making process for funding STAP. While the SPV option was not a preferred scenario for the City, Tranzito did provide a proposal that demonstrated multiple revenue opportunities in addition to advertising with a significant share of those revenues to the City as well as a Minimum Annual Guarantee (MAG). While Tranzito's proposal had the highest level of capital expenditure, those expenses addressed the majority of STAP goals and had the best potential to achieve those goals.

Outfront/Decaux's price proposal offered preferred scenarios for capital participation by a private partner; however, the City's share of revenue in either of those scenarios was either zero or an inadequate percentage. The proposed scenario for 100% City capital participation also offered an inadequate share of revenue to the City. Outfront/Decaux did offer a tiered share structure where the City would have receive a higher percentage upon achievement of higher levels of revenue, but the associated thresholds are not reasonably attainable based on the respondent's revenue projections and reference checks. An additional concern was that the estimated capital was understated as Outfront/Decaux proposed limited quantities of program elements that could address STAP goals.

Intersection proposed only the scenario where the City would provide 100% of the capital and requested the City also participate at some level (up to 50%) in operating expenses related to "Digital Hardware Maintenance." Intersection did state that it could provide scenarios as requested in the RFP with outside capital funding, but those would be proposed using a Special Purpose Vehicle. Intersection's sole proposal would require a longer term than 10 years to be financially feasible. Additionally, without providing at least the two other scenarios for 50% and 100% partner capital participation, Intersection's price proposal could not be properly compared with the other responses. Therefore, Intersection was eliminated during this assessment and did not receive an associated rank.

**RESPONDENT: TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY**

**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS**

**WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
<b>Qualifications of the Firm Score:</b>	<b>15</b>
<p><b>Remarks: Proposer met all stated criteria. Proposal includes a partnership of multiple companies with extensive experience in each of their areas of expertise, but their experience working together was not discussed.</b></p>	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
<b>Approach &amp; Methodology Score:</b>	<b>23</b>
<p><b>Remarks: Proposer exceeded the stated criteria and provided information on a robust Content Management System capable of addressing the City's needs.</b></p>	

**RESPONDENT: TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY**

<b>3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans</b>		<b>(0-15 points)</b>
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.	
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals		
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need		
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods		
<b>Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:</b>		<b>14</b>

Remarks: Proposer exceeded the stated criteria and their proposal included a section devoted to this area along with a detailed plan.

<b>4. Design</b>		<b>(0-15 points)</b>
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.	
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W		
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP		
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity		
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W		
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)		
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City		
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments		
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components		
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter		
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services		
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards		
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image		
<b>Design Score:</b>		<b>14</b>

Remarks: Proposer exceeded the stated criteria and provided case studies of designs.

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	<b>Sustainability Points: 8</b>
<b>Remarks: Proposer met all stated criteria.</b>	

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
<b>Innovative Approaches Points: 9</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>Remarks: Proposer exceeded the stated criteria by providing case studies of where they've implemented their creative and innovative ideas.</b>	

<b>TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS</b>	<b>83</b>
---	-----------

**RESPONDENT: TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY**

**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS**

**WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	

**Qualifications of the Firm Score:** 21

**Remarks:** Qualifications met through combination of experience of proposing firm plus featured partners/subcontractors, with Tranzito as the lead partner.

**2. Approach & Methodology**

**(0-25 points)**

2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	

**Approach & Methodology Score:** 23

**Remarks:** Solid business plan but dependent on coordination of featured partners and subcontractors. Heavy focus on the deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components, including incorporation of Mobility Hubs, 5G, and crossover with other City transportation and technology initiatives.

<b>3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans</b>	<b>(0-15 points)</b>
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
<b>Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:</b>	<b>11</b>

**Remarks:** Provides multiple scenarios for rollout; does not quite hit the 770 goal laid out in RFP but proposes higher level of digital advertising

<b>4. Design</b>	<b>7</b>
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	
<b>Design Score:</b>	

**Remarks:** Mobility Hub-centered approach with "kit-of-parts" for variation based on physical site conditions, cultural interests, community needs, "themes"; multiple iterations available as a result

<b>5. Sustainability</b>	<b>(0-10 points)</b>
--------------------------	----------------------



5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	

<b>Sustainability Points:</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Remarks:</b>	

<b>6. Innovative Approaches</b>	<b>(0-10 points)</b>
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	

<b>Innovative Approaches Points:</b>	<b>9</b>
--------------------------------------	----------

**Remarks:** mobility hub approach provides multiple options to complement and supplement transit shelters; Artreach approach to focus on local public art

<b>TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS</b>	<b>85</b>
---	-----------

**Reviewer Name:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Reviewer Signature:** \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_/\_\_\_/21

**RESPONDENT: TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY**

**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS**

**WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
<b>Qualifications of the Firm Score:</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>Remarks:</b> Each consultant highly qualified; history as a team? Diversity in specialty, expertise of various firms they're collaborating with is a strength.	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
<b>Approach &amp; Methodology Score:</b>	<b>23</b>

**Remarks:**  
**Exceeds expectations on their ambitious vision for STAP, including equitable distribution. Exceeds expectations for their sales plan. Good understanding of the City, helpful that they are already working with LADOT on mobility hubs.**

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
<b>Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:</b>	

**Remarks:**  
**Robust transition plan, concerned about the number of consultants that would be leading different efforts. Awareness of policy groups to focus on is good. No mention of the refresh program. Incorporation of equity in distribution. Strong community outreach plan.**

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	

Design Score:	12
<b>Remarks:</b> Thoughtful incorporation of digital components. Roof structure and panels seem a little disconnected. Not much design variety outside of their roof panels. Strong team to further expand upon proposed designs.	
<b>5. Sustainability</b>	<b>(0-10 points)</b>
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	<b>Sustainability Points:</b> 7
<b>Remarks:</b>	
<b>6. Innovative Approaches</b>	<b>(0-10 points)</b>
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
<b>Innovative Approaches Points:</b>	10
<b>Remarks:</b>	
<b>TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS</b> 83	

**RESPONDENT: TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY**

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS	WEIGHT RATIONALE
<b>1. Qualifications of the Firm</b>	<b>(0-25 points)</b>
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
<b>Qualifications of the Firm Score:</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>Remarks:</b> Current operator of Metro Bike Hub and Metro Bike Share. Tranzito has compiled a collaborative and highly experienced team, each at the top of their field.	
<b>2. Approach &amp; Methodology</b>	<b>(0-25 points)</b>
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
<b>Approach &amp; Methodology Score:</b>	

**Remarks:** Propose 734 new shelters (mobility hubs) and 300 refurbished shelters installed in year 1. Unique networking solutions including using Vertical Bridge as a backhaul partner to fund required infrastructure for 5G, and use of LoRaWAN to provide ePaper displays when only solar power is available. Propose centrally located maintenance warehouse

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
<b>Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:</b>	<b>13</b>

**Remarks:** No allocation for sidewalk reconstruction - mention coordination with Complete Streets and Sidewalk Repair Program which may not provide the necessary overlap. Propose 734 new shelters (mobility hubs) and 300 refurbished shelters installed in year 1. Streamlined permitting and packaging of sites 6-months before deployment of shelters. Teaming with Black & Veatch for construction management.

4. Design	(0-15 points)	
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.	
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W		
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP		
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity		
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W		
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)		
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City		
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments		
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components		
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter		
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services		
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards		
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image		
<b>Design Score:</b>		<b>14</b>

**Remarks:** Flexible kit of parts. Trellis with vegetation poses maintenance questions. Community push back regarding "billboards" was not considered. Overall, the design concepts are interesting and functional, and responsive to the City's vision.

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
<b>Sustainability Points:</b>	<b>9</b>

**Remarks:** Mobility Hub Eco Shelters operating on solar power. Eco hubs can "grow" with newly installed power.

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
<b>Innovative Approaches Points:</b>	<b>9</b>

**Remarks:** Propose utilizing STAP for pilot programs. Equitable and aspirational vision of integrated bus stops evolving into mobility hubs, and integration of emerging technology. Partner with local artists/art galleries to include local art.

<b>TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS</b>	<b>89</b>
---	-----------

**RESPONDENT: TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY**

**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS**

**WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
<b>#NAME?</b>	<b>19</b>
<p><b>Remarks: Tranzito has assembled a very strong overall project team, with Vector Media, Black and Veatch, AP Construction, and Fehr and Peers, along with strong design partners. As a lead firm, Tranzito will also be leading maintenance and operations as well as systems integration. Gene Oh made a fairly convincing case during the interview on the value of non-traditional companies (such as Apple) in transforming traditional business sectors. But their proposal was short on details on Tranzito's own experience in managing comparable street furniture or advertising programs; they only cited a mobility hub pilot program, so it's unclear whether the RFP's requirement of five years of experience is met.</b></p>	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
<b>Approach &amp; Methodology Score: 22</b>	



Remarks: The team's overall approach to rollout and deployment was thoughtful, and seemed to be based on realistic rather than optimistic assumptions about permitting obstacles. This would include significant attention to outreach to neighborhood councils and City Council offices, as well as an overall outreach strategy that meets people where they are. Vector seems to have strong experience and capability to manage a program of this type. However, the sales plan had less detail than provided in some of the other proposals on topics such as hyperlocal or specialized markets.

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
<b>Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:</b>	<b>12</b>

Remarks:Tranzito outlined a thoughtful transition plan, including a pre-launch (Year 0) strategy. Did say that their deployment would rely on an expedited City process.

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	

<b>Design Score:</b>	<b>12</b>
----------------------	-----------

Remarks: Tranzito has assembled a strong design team, with SOM, Studio One Eleven, BMV Design Works (for industrial design) and Fehr and Peers, which each bring unique strengths to the mix. The overall design approach has a clean and streamlined look that does evoke traditions of California Modernism. The kit of parts approach provides some simplicity and flexibility. However, much of the design relies upon the large scale "Icon" panel, which may be so large as to overwhelm local communities visually and become magnets for graffiti, so these assumptions may need to be scaled back. The six themes do allow for some additional tailoring to local conditions and preferences. I do not agree with their recommendation to brand the STAP program itself visually on the street furniture.

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	

<b>Sustainability Points:</b>	<b>8</b>
-------------------------------	----------

Remarks: Proposal had strong sustainability features, particularly the emphasis on 2,000 "Eco" shelters with solar panels. Less emphasis on shade strategies specifically than in some of the other proposals.

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	

<b>Innovative Approaches Points:</b>	<b>10</b>
--------------------------------------	-----------

Remarks: Very strong on innovative approaches, befitting Tranzito's strong background in mobility technology. Particularly strong in seeing digital technology as enabling first/last mile connections. Bringing in Nic Cha Kim to curate the public art program is a positive addition.

<b>TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS</b>	<b>83</b>
---	-----------

**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS**

**WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
<b>Qualifications of the Firm Score:</b>	
<b>Remarks:</b>	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
<b>Approach &amp; Methodology Score:</b>	<b>18</b>

Remarks:	
<b>3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans</b>	<b>(0-15 points)</b>
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
<b>Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:</b>	<b>12</b>

Remarks:

<b>4. Design</b>	<b>(0-15 points)</b>
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	

<b>Design Score:</b>	<b>10</b>
----------------------	-----------

Remarks:

<b>5. Sustainability</b>	<b>(0-10 points)</b>
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
<b>Sustainability Points:</b>	<b>8</b>

Remarks:

<b>6. Innovative Approaches</b>	<b>(0-10 points)</b>
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
<b>Innovative Approaches Points:</b>	<b>9</b>

Remarks:

<b>TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS</b>	<b>77</b>
---	-----------

**RESPONDENT: TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY**

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS	WEIGHT RATIONALE
<b>1. Qualifications of the Firm</b>	<b>(0-25 points)</b>
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
<b>Qualifications of the Firm Score:</b>	<b>20</b>
<p><b>Remarks: Very complete and detailed proposal. Very innovative. What might be a very optimistic picture of financing and schedule to implement.</b></p>	
<b>2. Approach &amp; Methodology</b>	<b>(0-25 points)</b>
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
<b>Approach &amp; Methodology Score:</b>	

Remarks: Complete and detailed proposal. Very innovative, not sure that they have or expressed that they had a good concept of the gravity of what would be involved with device maintenance - effort and cost. What might be a very optimistic picture of financing and schedule to implement.

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
<b>Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:</b>	<b>10</b>

Remarks: Appears well thought out and aggressive.

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	
<b>Design Score:</b>	

Remarks: The designs that leaned toward the larger monolith NYC style didn't seem to fit the City - too obtrusive and gawdy for a City that is generally opposed to traditional billboards.

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
<b>Sustainability Points:</b>	<b>7</b>

Remarks: Response appears to address/meet the stated criteria

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
<b>Innovative Approaches Points:</b>	<b>8</b>

Remarks: Overall very innovative. Technical approach to connectivity extremely innovative and may be a critical factor in the cost effective operation and sustainability of the devices.

<b>TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS</b>	<b>78</b>
---	-----------



**RESPONDENT: TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY**

**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS**

**WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
<b>Qualifications of the Firm Score:</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>Impressive track record with other cities</b>	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
<b>Approach &amp; Methodology Score:</b>	

Great experience not so much discussion on disposal of static advertising waste

3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans	(0-15 points)
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
<b>Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:</b>	<b>12</b>

Appears to have an achievable plan

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	
<b>Design Score:</b>	

**Impressive design and digital approach**

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	

<b>Sustainability Points:</b>	<b>8</b>
-------------------------------	----------

**Some aspects of this criteria were not addressed directly however respondent committed to work with the City in the practical application**

6. Innovative Approaches	(0-10 points)
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	

<b>Innovative Approaches Points:</b>	<b>10</b>
--------------------------------------	-----------

**Pressentation demonstrated a very innovative and modern approach including proposal to colocate communications equipment at certain mobility hubs.**

<b>TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS</b>	<b>91</b>
---	-----------

RESPONDENT: TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY	
TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS	WEIGHT RATIONALE
<b>1. Qualifications of the Firm</b>	<b>(0-25 points)</b>
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
<b>Qualifications of the Firm Score:</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>Remarks:</b>	
<b>2. Approach &amp; Methodology</b>	<b>(0-25 points)</b>
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	
2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	
<b>Approach &amp; Methodology Score:</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>Remarks:</b>	
<b>3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans</b>	<b>(0-15 points)</b>
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
<b>Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>Remarks:</b>	
<b>4. Design</b>	<b>(0-15 points)</b>
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	
<b>Design Score:</b>	
<b>Remarks:</b>	
<b>5. Sustainability</b>	<b>(0-10 points)</b>
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.
5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
<b>Sustainability Points:</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>Remarks:</b>	
<b>6. Innovative Approaches</b>	<b>(0-10 points)</b>
Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	Points are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	
<b>Innovative Approaches Points:</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>Remarks:</b>	
<b>TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY TOTAL TECHNICAL POINTS</b>	<b>86</b>

**RESPONDENT: TRANZITO SMART MOBILITY**

**TECHNICAL PROPOSAL CRITERIA AND EVALUATION FACTORS**

**WEIGHT RATIONALE**

1. Qualifications of the Firm	(0-25 points)
1.1 Company profile	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
1.2 Minimum five (5) years experience in the development and management of similar projects within the past 5 years in large urban environments	
1.3 Experience in the implementation of new forms of technology	
1.4 Experience in the development and management of revenue generating programs for public clients	
1.5 Project Manager has a minimum of five (5) years experience in managing large infrastructure or out of home programs	
1.6 Project Team has knowledge and experience to fulfill the required services	
1.7 References	
<b>Qualifications of the Firm Score:</b>	<b>23</b>
<p><b>Remarks:</b> Tranzito team exceeds years of experience in the development for the required time period and in large urban areas. The company has experience in the implementation of new technology. Management team has a number of years managing large programs or out of home programs. They possess the experience implementing digital displays with new forms of technology. The team displays the knowledge and experience to provide the City with a positive STAP program.</p>	
2. Approach & Methodology	(0-25 points)
2.1 Understanding and commitment to the City's vision and goals for the STAP, especially equity	Scores are awarded on the following basis: Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information. Poor 1-5: marginally meets the stated criteria. Satisfactory 6-10: meets most of the stated criteria. Good 11-20: meets all stated criteria. Excellent 21-25: exceeds the stated criteria.
2.2a Business Plan: qualified, motivated project team members, their roles, responsibilities and time commitment, and support from corporate/organizational expertise	
2.2b Business Plan: day-to-day operations and program management, and how operations will not interfere with regular activities in City R/W	
2.2c Business Plan: deployment and use of digital displays and smart/technology components	
2.2d Business Plan: deployment and use of Content Management System (CMS) that monitors digital elements, schedules real-time information and advertising placement, and reviews advertising content to ensure adherence City's Advertising Policy	
2.2e Business Plan: cleaning and maintenance schedules respond to requirements of RFP Sec. 10.1, and plan provided to report maintenance activities into StreetsLA's Asset Management Reporting System	
2.3a Sales Plan: experience in selling out-of-home media, qualified sales team, plans and expectations for national, regional and local sales	

2.3b Sales Plan: opportunities and strategies to expand categories of advertisers including specific strategies for STAP to reach multiple populations, opportunities and strategies for programmatic selling (of ad space) and creative/innovative opportunities (experiential advertising)	
2.3c Sales Plan: sales goals to increase gross revenue, maintain occupancy rates 80% or higher, diversify categories of advertisers, increase multicultural advertisers, maintain comparable and competitive sales rates, develop opportunities for small, local businesses to buy ad space in their neighborhoods, demonstrate experiential/innovative forms of advertising	
2.3d Sales Plan: explanation for establishment of national, regional and local rates for sale of ad space, public service advertising rates and fees, premium charges and/or discounts, policies that limit or don't allow barter, over-posting and bonusing	
2.3e Sales Plan: advertising contract terms, internal controls and procedures for verifying/validating billings and rates	
2.3f Sales Plan: removal or disposal of advertising materials, particularly concerning waste from static vinyl materials	
2.3g Sales Plan: experience with data collection from digital/technological assets, practices in data use/sales and data protection/security	

**Approach & Methodology Score:** **23**

**Remarks: Tranzito team is qualified and motivated. Each section head understands their roles, responsibilities and time commitment. They have experience with deploying and using digital displays. They understand the City's goals for the STAP. Their CMS program seems top grade with providing a variety of information and up to day news worthy info, include possible interrupted bus service. Thier installation plan shows equitable distribution.**

<b>3. Program Build Out (Transition) and Refresh/Relocation Plans</b>	<b>(0-15 points)</b>
3.1a Build Out /Transition Plan: Respondent addresses transition from current program to STAP including key tasks of maintaining existing program furniture and retaining existing and attracting new advertisers	<p>Scores are awarded on the following basis:  Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information.  Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria.  Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria.  Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria.  Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
3.1b Build Out/Transition Plan: Respondent provides a plan and schedule for the development and replacement of high revenue generating locations with realistic delivery timelines that addresses STAP's revenue goals	
3.2a Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent addresses the City's goals to refresh and repurpose existing shelters in an effort to expedite delivery of shade, shelter and safety to areas of greatest need	
3.2b Refresh/Relocation Plan: Respondent's plan demonstrates reuse of advertising elements that is engaging and beneficial for communities and neighborhoods	
<b>Program Build Out and Refresh/Relocation Plans Score:</b>	<b>13</b>

**Remarks: The Tranzito team explained a transtion program to maintain and/or relocate current shelters and replace with models with electronic ad displays to attract new advertisers. Their sales plan's goal is to make the City the number one media market.**

4. Design	(0-15 points)
4.1a Respondent provided six (6) conceptual shelter designs that focus on providing shelter, shade, safety and comfort	<p>Scores are awarded on the following basis:  Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information.  Poor 1-3: marginally meets the stated criteria.  Satisfactory 4-6: meets most of the stated criteria.  Good 7-12: meets all stated criteria.  Excellent 13-15: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
4.1b Designs respond to needs of transit riders, pedestrians and other users of City R/W	
4.1c Understands ADA, ADAS and PROWAG requirements; considers Title VI requirements especially limited and non-English speaking populations; and, demonstrates support for City initiatives to increase access to services associated with STAP	
4.1d Designs are modular and/or available in configurations that can address site constraints, neighborhood context and varying levels of transit ridership and pedestrian activity	
4.1e Designs are cost-efficient, having considered manufacturing and maintenance costs, as well as effective, having considered changes in society, marketplace, technology and use of the City R/W	
4.1f Designs of shelters and other elements provide additional services and/or create efficiencies (see RFP section 6.1)	
4.2a Designs reflect cultural diversity of the City	
4.2b Designs propose materials, colors, textures and/or other features that enhance streetscape aesthetics, complement other design elements in R/W and ensure long-term life cycle in R/W environments	
4.2b Designs integrate sustainable materials and/or components	
4.2c Designs consider use/advantage of tree canopies that provide natural shade and shelter	
4.3a Designs consider digital and technological components that improve delivery of City services	
4.3b Digital and technological components are sensitive to surrounding environment and community standards	
4.4 Designs result in a strong STAP brand image	
<b>Design Score:</b>	

**Remarks: There are a variety of shelter configurations that will address sidewalk constraints. Desings will reflect cultural diversity of the City. The icon products are digital with technological componnts that improve delivery of City services. The various shelter designs integrate sustainable materieals which are eco friendly.**

5. Sustainability	(0-10 points)
5.1a Respondent demonstrates commitment to sustainability through design and use of materials that conserve natural resources (low-impact, natural, renewable, recyclable and non-toxic materials/sources)	<p>Points are awarded on the following basis:  Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information.</p>

5.1b Static advertising/display materials are biodegradable and/or commonly recyclable materials, or respondent has provided a reuse/repurposing plan for advertising/display materials	<p>information.</p> <p>Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria.</p> <p>Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria.</p> <p>Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.</p> <p>Excellent 9-10: exceeds the stated criteria.</p>
5.1c Maintenance and operations considers and/or emphasizes low-impact and non-toxic materials and methods	
5.1d Respondent proposes a significant level of reuse, repurposing and, when necessary, eventual recycling of existing program furniture	
5.1e Respondent's proposal further reduces waste by ensuring quality material/construction that withstands environmental factors, such as sunlight, heat, precipitation and wind stress, as well as intense, rough and abrading use	
5.1c Respondent provides shade through program elements and takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	
5.2a Respondent proposes actions to strengthen the City's resilience to climate change through the integration of renewable energy into its furniture	
5.2b Respondent minimizes STAP's carbon footprint through local and/or low-carbon manufacturing, low-carbon maintenance equipment, and/or other GHG mitigation strategies.	
5.3a Digital or technological components and lighting are high efficiency and have ENERGY STAR ratings or better, where such ratings are available.	
5.3b Digital displays, lighting and any other energy consuming equipment minimize energy demand, including through the ability to automatically adjust according to time of day and ambient light/sunlight	
5.4 Respondent facilitates and/or takes advantage of tree canopies for natural shade opportunities	

**Sustainability Points:**

**9**

**Remarks:** Shelter infrastructure designs display materials that are recyclable or can be reused. The team noted the importance of minimizing the programs carbon footprint and low carbon manufacturing.

**6. Innovative Approaches**

**(0-10 points)**

Respondent demonstrates creativity and innovation that would engage transit riders, pedestrians as well as advertisers. Some examples are provided as follows:	<p>Points are awarded on the following basis:</p> <p>Non-responsive 0: fails to meet stated criteria/lacks essential information.</p> <p>Poor 1-2: marginally meets the stated criteria.</p> <p>Satisfactory 3-4: meets most of the stated criteria.</p> <p>Good 5-8: meets all stated criteria.</p>
Public art features reflective of community	
Kiosks that increase access to city services, such as bill paying, parking tickets, transit fare payment	
Experiential advertising, such as product sampling, social media integration/activation	
Demand side platforms where local businesses can buy advertising within their neighborhoods/business districts	

**Innovative Approaches Points:**

**9**

**Remarks:** The shelter designs demonstrated creativity and innovation that will enhance bus riders' experience with the emphasis on safety. Shelters will have six themes to allow public art that reflects the community.



